

## LOCAL STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION REPORT

### GOLD STANDARD PROGRAMME OF ACTIVITIES (PoA)

#### CONTENTS

##### **A. Description of the Programme**

1. Name, purpose and eligibility of the Programme
2. Current status of the Programme

##### **B. Design of Stakeholder Consultation Process**

1. Description of physical meeting(s)
  - i. Agenda
  - ii. Non-technical summary
  - iii. Invitation tracking table
  - iv. Text of individual invitations
  - v. Text of public invitations
2. Description of other consultation methods used

##### **C. Consultation Process**

1. Participants' in physical meeting(s)
  - i. List
  - ii. Evaluation forms
2. Pictures from physical meeting(s)
3. Outcome of consultation process
  - i. Minutes of physical meeting(s)
  - ii. Minutes of other consultations
  - iii. Assessment of all comments
  - iv. Revisit sustainable development assessment
  - v. Summary of changes to project design based on comments

##### **D. Sustainable Development Assessment**

1. Own sustainable development assessment
  - i. 'Do no harm' assessment
  - ii. Sustainable development matrix
2. Stakeholders blind sustainable development matrix
3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

##### **E. Discussion on Sustainability Monitoring Plan**

##### **F. Description of Stakeholder Feedback Round**

##### **Annex 1. Original participants list**

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### Annex 2. Original feedback forms

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### SECTION A. DESCRIPTION of the PROGRAMME

#### A. 1. Name, purpose and eligibility of the Programme

##### Name of the Programme

Indonesia Domestic Biogas Programme of Activities (IDBP) (ID 1172)

##### Purpose of the Programme

The application of biogas for cooking purposes is a relatively unknown practice in Indonesia. Aside from a number of pilot programmes implemented over the past two decades, biodigester use has hardly penetrated nationwide due to habitual, financial and technological barriers.

The objective of the proposed Indonesia Domestic Biogas Programme of Activities ('programme') is to develop a biogas sector through a market approach and realise the installation of approximately 80,000 biodigesters at households, local communities, SMEs ('users') with livestock across Indonesia between 2011 and 2020. The programme stimulates nationwide adoption of biogas technology through:

- (i) capacity development targeting households, local communities, SMEs, construction service providers and equipment suppliers;
- (ii) provision of an investment subsidy to households, local communities, SMEs on the purchase of the biogas technology, and;
- (iii) offering of credit facilities through a number of affiliated financial institutions.

The biodigester technology promoted under this programme offers its users access to clean and renewable energy. This energy is generated by burning the methane gas from the digestion of animal manure. The digestion takes place in a biodigester tank outside of the house or building of the user. This programme reduces both carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions from the use of fossil fuels or non-renewable biomass for cooking purposes, and mitigates methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) emissions from the baseline manure treatment practices. Aside from mitigating impact on climate change, the programme also positively contributes to the energy security across the country.

##### Eligibility of the Programme

According to the Gold Standard guidance (v2.1), the programme is considered eligible if all of the following conditions are satisfied:

- *Scale of the activity:* The programme will include small-scale and micro-scale voluntary project activities (VPAs) and shall therefore adhere to both small-scale programme rules listed in Annex F of the Gold Standard Toolkit and micro-scale guidelines outlined in the Gold Standard's micro-scale programme rules. Emission reductions achieved by the micro-scale VPAs included in the programme shall be limited to a maximum of 10,000 tonnes of CO<sub>2</sub>e in any year of their crediting.
- *Host country:* The programme is located in the Republic of Indonesia, which is a Non-

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

Annex 1 Country under the Kyoto Protocol;

- *Type of activity:* The programme activity classifies as a Renewable Energy project. In accordance with Annex C to the Gold Standard Toolkit, biogas project activities shall be eligible for emission reductions from both methane avoidance and non-renewable fuel substitution as long as at the time of validation it can be proven that the system is designed in a way to make use of some of the biogas recovered for the delivery of energy services. The biodigesters implemented in this programme deliver renewable biogas for cooking purposes, which is combusted to generate heat.
- *Greenhouse gases:* The emission reduction of greenhouse gases (GHG) intended to be achieved by the programme includes methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), two GHGs that are eligible under Gold Standard;
- *Official Development Assistance:* Official Development Assistance (ODA) is used for the partial financing of the programme. The credits to be generated by programme are not transferred, directly or indirectly, to meet the funder's GHG reduction requirements. A written declaration of the programme's appropriate use of ODA has been issued and submitted to the Gold Standard Foundation, attached in an annex to the PoA-DD.
- *Timeframe:* The programme is being implemented at the time of first submission to the Gold Standard. The programme therefore intends to apply for Retroactive Registration and Retroactive Crediting of its first VPA(s);
- *Previous announcement:* The feasibility study for the IDBP drafted in January 2009 identifies carbon finance as an important mechanism to ensure the long-term feasibility of the programme which suffers from lack of funding and revenues.
- *Other certification schemes:* No credits related to GHG reductions of this programme are otherwise committed under another mechanism other than the Gold Standard one. Therefore, no double counting will occur from the issuance of Gold Standard carbon credits originating from this programme.

### A. 2. Current programme status

In 2008 SNV, at the request of the Government of Indonesia, carried out a feasibility study for a nationwide biogas programme. The study confirmed that biogas as a source of energy for cooking has great potential in Indonesia. Additionally, the application for carbon finance to secure the sustainability of the programme in the long term was also mentioned. Based on the findings, the Royal Netherlands Embassy decided to initiate support to the Indonesian Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources in setting up the IDBP in collaboration with the Dutch organisations Hivos and SNV. The Indonesian Directorate General for Electricity and Energy Utilization (DGNREEC), a directorate under the Ministry of Energy and Mining Resources (MEMR), became the Indonesian counterpart for the programme.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

The programme officially commenced in May 2009. IDBP established its central organisational framework and recruited its core staff by November 2009. The National Biogas Programme Support Office (NBPSO) was established, which supports local implementation of the biodigester programme through local offices. By the end of 2009 the first 62 biodigesters were commissioned, followed by an additional 1,583 in 2010 and 2,988 in 2011.

Currently, IDBP operates eight local offices across Indonesia. As per 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012, IDBP realised the construction of 4,555 units of biodigesters nationwide.

### SECTION B. DESIGN OF STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION PROCESS

#### B. 1. Design of physical meeting

##### i. Agenda

The agenda of the meeting is outlined below:

Time	Activity
08.00	Registration
08.30	Opening (objective of the day, rules of the day, agenda)
08.40	Presentation: IDBP Programme and progress update
09.00	Presentation: National Energy Scheme and its relation with IDBP
09.20	Questions and answers and clarifications for IDBP
10.00	Coffee break
10.15	Do No Harm assessment explanation
10.45	Blind exercise: Sustainable Development including discussion on the Monitoring of the Sustainable Development
12.15	Discussion: Selecting the Continuous Input Mechanism
12.30	Note on the stakeholder feedback round
12.40	Conclusions and closing
13.00	Lunch

##### ii. Non-technical summary of the Programme

The programme aims to install approximately 80,000 biodigesters at households, local

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

communities, SMEs with livestock across Indonesia between 2011 and 2020.

The biodigester technology implemented under this programme offers its users access to clean and renewable energy. This energy is generated by burning the methane gas that is recovered from animal manure stored in the biodigester tank outside of the house or building of the user. This clean energy reduces greenhouse gases and mitigates the impact on climate change, and also positively contributes to the energy security across the country.

The programme targets livestock owners that are currently relying on biomass and fossil fuel for cooking purposes. Purchasing fuel for cooking is expensive, and households, local communities, SMEs spend a lot of their time collecting fuel. Furthermore, burning fuel, especially firewood, for cooking purposes is not healthy as it causes respiratory diseases, especially affecting women and children who spend most of the time indoors.

Participation in the programme is entirely voluntary. The biodigester technology is affordable as the programme offers a subsidy, hereby allowing households, local communities, SMEs to invest in a biodigester either from accrued savings or through the offering of a loan. The users are trained on how to use and maintain the biodigester once installed. The operation of the biodigester is relatively easy and includes daily feeding of the system with a mixture of manure and water. The resulting waste sludge can be applied as fertiliser on farm land.

The programme brings a number of environmental and sustainable development benefits. These include:

1. Substitution of expensive fossil fuels such as kerosene and LPG, freeing up households, local communities, SMEs' finances;
2. Substitution of firewood, freeing up time spent to collect the wood and mitigating impact on deforestation;
3. Elimination of dangerous fumes that can lead to respiratory diseases in households, local communities, SMEs;
4. Generation of waste sludge that can be used as fertiliser and substitute expensive artificial fertilisers;
5. Creation training and job opportunities in the programme for the local community;
6. Offering of subsidy money and loans to facilitate the investment by the households, local communities, SMEs.

### iii. Invitation tracking table

Category (code)	Organisation	Name of invitee	Way of invitation	Date of invitation	Y/N?
Local people or their official representatives	KPSP Setia Kawan, farmers' cooperative	H. Haryanto	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes
	Site Manager LPTP, farmers' cooperative	Sumino	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes
	PT Nestle Indonesia, farmers' cooperative	Yuli Sari Yeni	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 12, 2012	Yes

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

(A)						
	Biogas user in East Java, Head of Village Women Group	Sunarti	By airmail & fax	Jan 17, 2012	Yes	
	Tandanghari Saving-Loan Cooperative, Tanjungsari	Toni Kartobi	By airmail & fax	Jan 17, 2012	Yes	
	Global News, media	Danny	By text message	Feb 15, 2012	Yes	
	Berita Metro, media	Yudi	By text message	Feb 15, 2012	Yes	
	Dairy Farmers' Cooperative	Ramdan Sobari	By text message	Feb 15, 2012	Yes	
Local government	Mining and Energy Division, Office of Public Works, Bali Province	Ir. I Putu Agus Budiana, M.Si	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes	
	Mining and Energy Department, West Nusa Tenggara Province	Ir. Eko Bambang Sutedjo	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes	
	Mining and Energy Department, East Nusa Tenggara Province	Drs. Bria Yohanes,	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes	
	Mining and Energy Department, North Sumatera Province	Ir. Gembira Sebayang	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes	
	Mining and Energy Department, North Sumatera Province	Ir. Andawarneri,	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
	(B) Mining and Energy Department, West Sumatera Province	Ir. Robert Heri.	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
	Mining and Energy Department, Jambi Province	Ir. Irmansyah Rachman.	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
	Mining and Energy Department, Lampung Province	Ir E Piterdono HZ SE MM	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
	Mining and Energy Department, West Sulawesi Province	Agussalim Tamadjoe	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
	Mining and Energy Department, Riau Province	Isdianto	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No	
		Ministry of Finance	Ir. Musdhalifah M., MT	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
		Ministry of Environment	Ir. Laksmi Dhewanthi, M.A	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Ministry of Cooperatives and Small and Medium Enterprises	Ir. Victoria br. Simanungkalit, MM	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes	
	Ministry of National	Ir. Jadhie J.	By airmail	Jan 9, 2012	Yes	

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Local policy makers & representatives  (B)	Development Planning	Ardajat,	& fax		
	Center for Research and Technological Development of Renewable Electricity and Energy	Director	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Ministry of Agriculture	Dr. Bess Tiesnamurti,	By airmail, Fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Ministry of Agriculture, Directorate General of Livestock	Ir. Fauzi Luthan,	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Mining and Energy Department, West Java Province	Ir. Yerry Yanuar M.M	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Mining and Energy Department, Central Java Province	Ir. Teguh Dwi Paryono, MT,	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Mining and Energy Department, East Java Province	Zainuddin	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Mining and Energy Department, D.I Yogyakarta Province	Ir. Rani Sjamsinarsi, M.T,	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Mining and Energy Department, South Sulawesi Province	Ir. H Gunawan Palaguna Msi	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Hivos RO SEA	Jan Jaap Kleinrensink	Directly	Jan 13, 2012	No
	SNV International	Sundar Bajgain	Directly	Jan 13, 2012	Yes
	Ministry of Social Affairs	Ahmad Sobari	By airmail, Fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Ministry of Forestry	Dr. Yetty Rusli	By airmail, & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	National Council on Climate Change	Mr. Rachmat Witoelar	By airmail, & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
Local NGO representatives working on topic relevant to programme  (D)	Yayasan Keanekaragaman Hayati Indonesia (KEHATI)	Arnold Sitompul, Ph.d	By airmail, Fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	VECO Indonesia	Rogier Eijkens	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	No
	CARE Indonesia	Margaretha Ari Widowati,	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	WALHI	Pius Ginting	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Yayasan Pelangi	Nur Amalia	By airmail & fax	Jan 9, 2012	No
	Indonesian Climate Action Network (ICAN)	Fabby Tumiwa	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 17, 2012	No



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	Indonesian Law Study Foundation	Wagiman	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	No
	Marine and Coastal Resources Study Centre, Bogor Agricultural Institute (IPB)	Arief Budi Purwanto	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	Yes
International development organisation  (F)	Gold Standard Foundation	Ellen May Zanoria Reynes	By email	Jan 9, 2012	Yes
	Millenium Corporation Challenge Indonesia	Y. Nindito Adisuryo	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 20, 2012	Yes
	Millenium Corporation Challenge Indonesia	Gofur	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 20, 2012	Yes
	Millenium Corporation Challenge Indonesia	Wray Troy	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 20, 2012	No
	Winrock International	Bernard Castermans	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	No
	WWF	Klaas-Jan Teule	By airmail, Fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	No
	United Nation Development Program (UNDP)	Verania Andria	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	No
	USAID	Retno Setianingsih	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 9, 2012	No
	KfW	Cynthia Hendrayani	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 25, 2012	No
	KfW	Thorsten Schneider	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 25, 2012	No
	Climate Focus	Szymon Mikolajczyk	By email	Jan 17, 2012	Yes
Others	PT Bank Nasional Indonesia (Persero)	Leonard T Panjaitan	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 20, 2012	Yes
	Persatuan Insinyur Indonesia	Ir. Bambang Purwohadi	By airmail, fax & email	Jan 25, 2012	Yes
	Micro Turbine Cogeneration Technology Application Project	Budi Prasetyo	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	No
	Yayasan Bitari	Ishak Tan	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	Yes
	LSM Lembaga Lingkar Bumi	Thomas Acquino	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	Yes

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	PT. Ilham Treda Industri	Bambang Agus	By airmail, fax & email	Feb 7, 2012	Yes
	Rabobank Foundation	Bern Dwyanto	By airmail & fax	Jan 12, 2012	Yes

*Please explain how you decided that the above organisations/ individuals are relevant stakeholders to your programme. Also, please discuss how your invitation methods seek to include a broad range of stakeholders (e.g. gender, age, and ethnicity).*

As indicated in the Programme Design Consultation (PDC) report submitted to the Gold Standard Foundation on 21<sup>st</sup> February 2012, prior to hosting the Local Stakeholder Consultation (LSC) Hivos consulted relevant stakeholders on whether to organise stakeholder consultations on a national level or various consultations in the different target regions. All stakeholders approached in the PDC agreed with the proposal from the IDBP to host one LSC meeting on programme level on the national level. Hivos therefore organised a single LSC meeting on the national level and invited a broad range of both national and regional stakeholders. To encourage all parties to be present, Hivos offered to sponsor the associated travel (flight, train and bus tickets) and sleeping arrangements (Hotel Ibis Tamarin, Jakarta).

The invitations sought to cover a broad range of stakeholder types representing all regions likely to be affected by the programme. Through its involvement in the programme since the setup in 2009 as the managing entity Hivos has built an extensive network with stakeholders both on the local and national level, placing this entity in the right position to identify the relevant stakeholders to the programme. In total 70 targeted invitations were sent out by electronic and regular mail, covering a wide range of stakeholders that included individuals, organisations, companies and government entities.

In order not to close the opportunity for other interested parties to join the LSC, Hivos also used alternative means of communicating to a broader audience concerning the occurrence of the meeting. As described in Section B.1.5 on this report, a public invitation for the LSC was published in Kompas Daily, the most widely read newspaper in Indonesia. Furthermore, a public announcement was published on the IDBP website ([www.biru.or.id](http://www.biru.or.id)). The presence of both the individual and general public invitations ensures broad representation and a good mix of viewpoints.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### iv. Text of individual invitations

#### Individual invitations (English version):



Attn to :  
**Szymon Mikołajczyk**  
Climate Focus BV  
Sarphatijkade 13  
1017 WV Amsterdam  
mobile: +31 6 1590 5779  
Office: +31 20 262 10 38  
E-mail: s.mikolajczyk@climatefocus.com

Date : 17 January 2012  
No. : 1.8.4/ 072/RdG/ac  
Re : Invitation to Local Stakeholders Meeting for qualification of CDM Gold Standard

Dear Sir,

Since May 2009, Hivos in cooperation with the Directorate General New Renewable Energy and Energy Conservation (DGNREEC) of the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources (MEMR) of the Republic of Indonesia, has implemented Indonesia Domestic Biogas Programme (also known as BIRU Programme). IDBP contributes to the improvement of access towards new renewable energy, quality of family's health and saving the government's subsidy on kerosene. IDBP aims to build 8,000 unit bio-digesters in minimum six provinces across Indonesia until the end of 2012. As per 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012, 4,555 units of bio-digesters have been constructed.

The Indonesia Domestic Biogas Programme (BIRU) aims to qualify under the Gold Standard certification, which is an international foundation that offers additional sponsorship to clean energy initiatives that reduce greenhouse gas emissions and promote sustainable development. Receiving this certification will enable the programme to offer subsidies to households that are interested in joining the programme, anywhere across Indonesia.

As part of the requirements put forth by the Gold Standard Foundation, the programme invites you to attend the stakeholder consultation meeting that BIRU will host in Jakarta. The meeting will be held on:

**Day / Date** : Thursday, 16 Februari 2012  
**Time** : 09.00 – 14.00  
**Venue** : (tbc)

We welcome you to attend this meeting to give you the possibility to learn more about the programme and listen to any feedback you may have concerning the design of the programme and its impacts on sustainable development.

We welcome you to read an introduction of the programme in Annex 1. For more information on IDBP, please visit our website [www.biru.or.id](http://www.biru.or.id), or you can reach us at +62 812 8030 2020 or by e-mail at [info@biru.or.id](mailto:info@biru.or.id) with specific information regarding addition requested programme documentation. The meeting agenda is can be seen in Annex 2.

Please notify us may you need assistance concerning the direction in Jakarta or suggestions for overnight stay, may such need be. Kindly fill in the form in Annex 3 and send it back to Agi S. Cakradirana melalui e-mail [a.cakradirana@hivos.or.id](mailto:a.cakradirana@hivos.or.id), or through facsimile number: +62 21 780 8115 by the latest on Friday, 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2012.

For your information, the announcement of this meeting will be released in KOMPAS daily newspaper on 18 January 2012. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best regards,



**Robert de Groot**  
IDBP Programme Manager  
Hivos Regional Office Southeast Asia

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### Annex 1 of the invitation (English version):

#### Annex 1

#### Introduction to the programme.



The Indonesia Domestic Biogas Gold Standard Programme aims to install about 90,000 small-size biodigesters at rural households throughout Indonesia by 2022.

The programme targets small-scale livestock owners that are currently relying on biomass and fossil fuel for cooking purposes. These households typically reside in rural areas and come from a poor and middle-income class. Purchasing fuel for cooking is expensive, and households spend a lot of their time collecting firewood to ensure enough fuel is present. Furthermore, burning wood for cooking purposes is not healthy as it causes respiratory diseases, especially affecting women and children who spend most of the time indoors.

The biodigester technology implemented under this programme will offer its users access to clean and renewable energy. This energy will be generated by burning the methane gas that will be generated from animal manure stored in the biodigester tank outside of the house of the user. This clean energy will reduce greenhouse gases and mitigate the impact on climate change, and also positively contribute to the general energy security of rural regions across the country.

Participation in the programme is entirely voluntary. The biodigester technology is affordable as the programme offers a subsidy, hereby allowing poor households to invest in a personal biodigester either from personal savings or through the offering of a loan. The users are trained on how to use and maintain the biodigester once installed, which is safe and straight forward. The operation of the technology mainly includes daily feeding of the installation with a mixture of manure and water. The resulting waste sludge can be applied as fertiliser on the farm land.

There are a number of environmental and sustainable development benefits associated with the programme. These include:

1. Substitution of expensive fossil fuels such as kerosene and LPG, freeing up household finances;
2. Substitution of firewood, freeing up time spent to collect the wood and mitigating impact on deforestation;
3. Elimination of dangerous fumes that can lead to respiratory diseases in households;
4. Generation of waste sludge that can be used as fertiliser and substitute expensive artificial fertilisers;
5. Creation training and job opportunities in the Programme for local people;
6. Offering of subsidy money and loans to facilitate the investment by the household.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### Annex 2 of the invitation (English version):

Annex 2

Local Stakeholders Consultation Meeting Agenda



Time	Activity	Remarks
08.00	Registration	Amalia Fubani
08.30	Opening	Facilitator
08.45	Programme's agenda explanation	Climate Focus or facilitator
09.00	Presentation: BIRU Programme and progress update	Robert de Groot
09.20	Presentation: National Energy Scheme and its relation with IDBP	Maritje Hutapea
10.20	Questions and answers and clarifications	Facilitator
10.45	Coffee break	
11.00	Blind exercise: Sustainable Development	
11.30	Discussion: Monitoring Sustainable Development	
12.00	Discussion: Selecting Continuous Input Mechanism	
12.30	Conclusions and closing	
13.00	Lunch	Amalia Fubani

### Annex 3 of the invitation:

Annex 3

Attendance Confirmation Form



Name	:	
Sex	:	Male                      Female
Organization	:	
Position	:	
E-mail	:	
Mobile number	:	
Will you participate in the LSC Meeting?	:	Yes                      No

Kindly fill return this form to Agi S. Cakradirana by e-mail to [a.cakradirana@hivos.or.id](mailto:a.cakradirana@hivos.or.id), or through facsimile number: +62 21 780 8115 by the latest on Friday, 3<sup>rd</sup> February 201

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### v. Text of public invitations

**Figure 1:** Text of public invitation for the LSC published in Kompas Daily (national newspaper) on Wednesday 18<sup>th</sup> of January 2012 (p.38)



Kompas Daily is the most widely read newspaper in Indonesia. It is published by the Kompas-Gramedia Group and has a reputation for high-quality writing and investigative journalism.

**Figure 2:** Text of public invitation for the LSC published on the IDBP website (www.biru.or.id)

**ANNOUNCEMENT: Local Stakeholder Consultation in preparation for qualification and certification of the Gold Standard.**

The meeting will be conducted on:

Day & Date: Thursday, February 16, 2012

Time: 08.00 s / d 13:00 pm

Venue: Hotel Ibis Tamarin, Jl. K.H. Wahid Hashim No.77 Central Jakarta, 10 340 - Indonesia

Agenda:

- Presentation of the Indonesian Domestic Biogas Programme
- Presentation of the National Energy Policy
- Question and Answer, and clarification
- Simulation of Sustainable Development
- Discussion of monitoring and feedback mechanisms

For further information please contact:

 021-789 2489  (ext. 121) -  0812 8030 2020  - E-mail: info@biru.or.id - Site: www.biru.or.id

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### B. 2. Description of other consultation methods used

*If individuals and/ or entities (e.g. NGOs) are unable to attend the physical meeting, please discuss other methods that were used to solicit their feedback/ comments (e.g. questionnaires, phone calls, interviews).*

Before the hosting the physical meeting, IDBP made repeated efforts to get in touch with the invitees by contacting them via mobile phone and e-mail. In some cases, to get their confirmation of attendance, IDBP also tried to contact the invitees through their staff, which was followed by re-sending the documents via facsimile. In situations where stakeholders could not make it to the physical meeting, they were invited to submit any queries or concern to Hivos via phone or e-mail.

## SECTION C. CONSULTATION PROCESS

### C. 1. Participants' in physical meeting(s)

#### i. List of participants

The original participants' list is included in Annex 1.

Category Code	Name of participant	Title	Male/ Female	Organisation	Contact details
Local people , or their official representatives  (A)	Sunarti	Head of Village Women Group	Female	(ID Plant under name of Suparno : SJP 0012)	Krenceng Village, Kepung Sub-district, Kediri District, East Java – Indonesia Mobile phone: +62 812 3417 1632
	Toni Kartobi	Dairy farmer/Co operative manager (ID plant no. STP 00012)	Male	Tandang Sari Saving-Loan Cooperative, Tanjungsari	Tanjungsari, Sumedang, West Java – Indonesia Mobile phone: +62 812 210 5645
	Sumino	Director	Male	LPTP	Komplek Kampus Adyhasa Jl. Raya Palur Km. 5 Tegal Asri, Rt 4/6, Karanganyar, Solo – Indonesia

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

					Mobile phone: +62 813 290 39 885 E-mail: mino@lptp.or.id
Yuli Sari Yeni	Creating Shared Value (CSV) Specialist	Female	Nestle	Wisma Nestle 5th Floor, Perkantoran Hijau Arkadia, Jl. Letjen TB Simatupang Kav. 88, Jakarta 12520 - Indonesia PO Box 5555 Jakarta 12000 Office phone: +62 21 788 36000 Office facsimile: +62 21 788 36001 Mobile phone: +62 8122 783 507 E-mail: yuli-sari.yeni@id.nestle.com	
Drh. Ramdan Sobari	Secretary	Male	Bandung Utara Dairy Farmers Cooperative	Jl. Pasar Panorama No. 23, Lembang, West Java – Indonesia Office phone: +62 22 2786 298 Office facsimile: +62 22 278 6431 Mobile phone: +62 811 220 4773 E-mail: ramdan@kpsbu.co.id	
H. Hariyanto	Secretary	Male	Dairy Farmer Cooperative (KPSP) Setia Kawan	Kecamatan Tukur, Pasuruan, Jawa Timur Office facsimile: +62 343 499 322 Mobile phone: +62 812 522 8446 E-mail: hariyantokpsp@yahoo.co.id	
Danny	Journalist	Male	Global News	redaksimo@yahoo.com Mobile phone: +62 815 669 6079	
Yudi	Reporter	Male	Berita Metro	-	



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Local government <b>(B)</b>	Ir. I Putu Agus Budiana, M.Si	Head of Mining and Energy Division	Male	Mining and Energy Division, Office of Public Works, Bali Province	Jl. Beliton No. 2, Denpasar 80235 – Bali - Indonesia Office phone: +62 361 222883 e-mail : pabudiana@yahoo.co.id Mobile phone: +62 812 389 0481
	Ir. Eko Bambang Sutedjo	Head of Mining and Energy Department	Male	Mining and Energy Department, West Nusa Tenggara Province	Jl. Majapahit No. 40, Kekalik Post box 1056, Mataram 83010 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 370 621356 - 625765 - 640748 Office facsimile: +62 370 625766 Mobile phone: +62 812 3707 459 E-mail : esutedjo@yahoo.co.id
	Ir. Gembira Sebayang	(Implementor) Head of Electricity and Energy Utilization	Male	Mining and Energy Department, North Sumatera Province	Jl. Setiabudi Pasar Dua No. 84, Tanjungsari Medan-20115, North Sumatera - Indonesia Office phone: +62 61 821 35 33 Office facsimile: +62 61 821 47 33 E-mail: gembirasebayang@gmail.com Mobile phone: +62 813 7560 1348
Local policy makers & representatives <b>(B)</b>	Sri Saptaningsih	Head of Sub-directorate of Environmental Incentive	Female	Ministry of Environment	Jl. D.I. Panjaitan Kav. 24 Kebon Nanas, Jakarta 13410 - Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 858 0067 to 68 +62 8517184 (hunting)

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

					E-mail: Saptalh@yahoo.com Mobile phone: +62 812 10 584 741
Ir. Victoria br. Simanungkalit, MM	Deputy Assistant for Electricity and Enterprise	Female	Ministry of Cooperative and Small- Medium Enterprises	Jl. H.R. Rasuna Said Kav. 3-4, Kuningan, Jakarta 12940 – Indonesia Office phoneL +62 21 520 4366 to 72 Office facsimile: +62 21 E-mail: victoria.paps@gmail.co m Mobile phone: +62 8111 895 61	
Ir. Maritje Hutapea	Director Bioenergy	Female	Ministry of Mineral and Energy Resources, Directorate General New Renewable Energy and Energy Conservation (DGNREEC)	Jl. Jend Gatot Subroto Kav 49, Jakarta – Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 525 454 508 Office facsimile: +62 21 255 291 06 Mobile phone: +62 812 80211 65 E-mail: mhutapea57@yahoo.co m	
Dr. Ir. Dadan Kusdiana, M.Sc	Head of Sub- directorate of Village Area	Male	Ministry of Mineral and Energy Resources, DGNREEC	Jl. Jend Gatot Subroto Kav 49, Jakarta – Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 525 454 508 Office facsimile: +62 21 255 291 06 Mobile phone: +62 812 100 2705 E-mail: dadankusdiana@gmail. com	
Fitria Astuti Firman, S.T, M.Eng.Sc	Head of Section Energy	Female	Ministry of Mineral and Energy	Jl. Jend Gatot Subroto Kav 49, Jakarta – Indonesia	

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	Programme at Village		Resources, DGNREEC	Office phone: +62 21 525 454 508 Office facsimile: +62 21 255 291 06 Mobile phone: +62 811 816 896 E-mail: fitria.firman@gmail.com
Sjaiful Ruchiat	Head of Sub-directorate	Male	Ministry of Mineral and Energy Resources, DGNREEC	Jl. Jend Gatot Subroto Kav 49, Jakarta – Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 525 454 508 Office facsimile: +62 21 255 291 06 E-mail: sjaiful_r@yahoo.com
Dr. Yetty Rusli	Expert Staff on Environment and Climate Change	Female	Ministry of Forestry	Gedung Manggala Wanabakti Blok I Lt. 3, Jalan Gatot Subroto - Senayan - Jakarta - Indonesia – 10270 Office phone: +62 21 570 4501 - 04; Office facsimile: +62 21 573 0385 Mobile phone: +62 812 992 8851 E-mail: yetti.rusli@gmail.com
Ahmad Sobari	Head of Sub-directorate Cooperation for Non-Government Organization, Planning Bureau	Male	Ministry of Social Affairs	Jl. Salemba Raya No. 28, Jakarta 10430 Office and facsimile number: +62 21 31000 309 Mobile phone: +62 813 1102 8881 E-mail: Shoby_73@yahoo.com
Drs. Agus Santoso	Head of Division of	Male	Mining and Energy	Jl. Madukoro AA-BB No.44 Semarang

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		Oil and Gas		Resources Office, Central Java Province	50144 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 247 608203, +62 247761 0121 Office facsimile: +62 247 7608379 Mobile phone: +62 815 655 4800
Ir. Akhmad Irianto	Head of Section		Male	Mining and Energy Resources Office, Central Java Province	Jl. Madukoro AA-BB No.44 Semarang 50144 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 247 608203, +62 247761 0121 Office facsimile: +62 247 7608379 Mobile phone: +62 815 6696 079 E-mail: irianto_distamben@yahoo.co.id
Zainuddin	Head of Section		Male	Mining and Energy Resources Office, East Java Province	Jl. Tidar No. 123, Surabaya - 60252 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 31 531 9337 Office facsimile: +62 31 531 9338 Mobile phone: +62 85755820821 E-mail: Zain_achmed@ymail.com
Agung Satrio	Head of Section		Male	Public Works and Mining & Energy Resources Office, D.I. Yogyakarta Province	Jl. Bumijo No 5, Yogyakarta – Indonesia Office phone: +62 274 589 074 Office facsimile: +62 274 550 320 Mobile phone: +62 812 279 0144 E-mail: agungsatrio82@yahoo.co.id

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	Ir. Gunawan Palaguna, M.Si	Head of Office	Male	Mining and Energy Resources Office, South Sulawesi Province	Jl. Andi Pangeran Pettarani PO BOX 19, Makasar 90222, South Sulawesi – Indonesia Office phone: +62 411 874467 - 873045 Office facsimile: +62 411 873524 Mobile phone: +62 811 415 156 E-mail: gunapalaguma@yahoo.co.id
Local NGO representatives working on topic relevant to programme  <b>(D)</b>	Pius Ginting	Mining and Energy Campaigner	Male	WALHI	Jl. Tegalparang Utara 14, Mampang, Jakarta Selatan 12790 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 7919 3363 Office facsimile: +62 21 794 1673 Mobile phone: +62 819 3292 5700 E-mail: pius.ginting@gmail.com
	Wagiman	Director	Male	Indonesian Law Study Foundation	Mobile phone: +62 878 940 85912, E-mail: wagiman2007@yahoo.com
	Ishak Tan	Director	Male	Bitari Foundation	Office phone: +62 22 70770554 Office e-mail: bittari@yahoo.com Mobile phone: +62 811 229 107 E-mail: Ishaktan_bitari@yahoo.com
	Thomas Aquino Taek, S.H., MM	General President	Male	Lingkar Bumi Foundation	E-mail: thomasaquino@yahoo.com.id

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	Bambang Agus		Male	PT. Ilham Treda Industri	Office phone: +62 21 3900 153 E-mail: bambang_ar@ilhamtreda.com
	Arief Budi Purwanto	Senior researcher	Male	Marine and Coastal Resources Study Centre, Bogor Agricultural Institute (IPB)	Mobile phone: +62 816 113 9310 E-mail: ariefpur@yahoo.com
	Wendie Razif Soetikno	Academic Development	Male	Keluarga Bunda Foundation	Mobile phone: +62 812 8649 1221 E-mail: wrazif@paxhigh.com
Gold Standard Expert  (E)	Ellen May Zanoria Reynes	South East Asia Regional Manager	Female	Gold Standard Foundation	Office phone: +65 6674 9115 Mobile phone: +65 9858 2496 E-mail: ellen@cdmgoldstandard.org
International development organisation  (F)	Y. Nindito Adisuryo	Green Prosperity Officer	Male	Millenium Corporation Challenge Indonesia	Mobile phone: +62 821 977 61 333 E-mail: Johann.nindito@gmail.com
	Gofur	Field Support Coordination	Male	Millenium Corporation Challenge Indonesia	Mobile phone: +62 8111 047 548 E-mail: ngofur@yahoo.com
	Margaretha Ari Widowati	SEAD Programme Leader	Female	CARE Indonesia	Tifa Building, 10th floor, Suite 1005 Jl. Kuningan Barat 26, Jakarta 12710 Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 529 222 82 Office facsimile: +62 21 529 222 83 E-mail: ariwidowati@centrin.net.id

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Others	Leonard T. Panjaitan	Manager of Corporate Sustainability	Male	PT BNI Persero, Corporate Communications and Secretary Division	Head Office Building 24th floor Jl. Jend Sudirman Kav 1 Jakarta Office phone: +62 21 5729298 Office facsimile: +62 21 572 8053 Mobile phone: +62 812 8679 1540 E-mail : leonard.tiopan@bni.co.id
	Bern Dwyanto	Project Manager	Male	Rabobank Foundation	JL.HR.Rasuna Said Kav.X-7 No 6,Jakarta 1294 – Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 252 0876 Office facsimile: +62 21 252 0875 E-mail: bern.dwyanto@rabobank.com
	Ir. Bambang Purwohadi, MSi, MT.	Vice Energy Section	Male	Engineers Association Indonesia	Jl. Halimun No. 39, Jakarta 12980 - Indonesia Office phone: +62 21 8352180-81 Office facsimile: +62 21 83700663 E-mail: bambang_purwohadi@yahoo.com Mobile phone: +62 811 173 194

The original invitation list attached in Annex 1 includes stakeholder's phone numbers and their signatures as initially provided in the LSC Report template.

### ii. Evaluation forms

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Below you can find 4 representative evaluation forms from the LSC in English. The original evaluation forms (in original language) are included in Annex 2.

### Original evaluation form 1:

<b>Name:</b> Bern Dwyanto	<b>Telephone:</b> +62 815 99 55 068
<b>Organisation:</b> Rabobank Foundation	<b>Email:</b> bern.dwyanto@rabobank.com
<i>What was your impression of the meeting?</i>	It was valuable for the general development of the biogas sector and to increase the biogas utilisation within local communities.
<i>What do you like about the IDBP programme?</i>	The programme utilises renewable energy which is cleaner, produces no emission and has many social and economic benefits.
<i>What do you do not like about the IDBP programme?</i>	None. I completely support the programme. However, the coordination between the field staff and the cooperative can be improved so that the targeted construction number can be achieved and the farmers can fully make use financial support offered by the programme.
<b>Signature:</b> See Annex 2	<b>Date:</b> 16 February 2012

### Original evaluation form 2:

<b>Name:</b> Ir. Gembira Sebayang	<b>Telephone:</b> +62 813 7560 1348 ; +62 61 821 3533
<b>Organisation:</b> Mining and Energy Office, North Sumatera Province	<b>Email:</b> gembirasebayang@rocketmail.com
<i>What was your impression of the meeting?</i>	Very good and useful both for Hivos and the overall community. The programme is also in line with the government's sustainability policies.
<i>What do you like about the IDBP programme?</i>	The programme generates a number of positive impacts: (1) it increases the welfare of community; (2) it increases the quality of human resources; (3) it generates clean, renewable energy.
<i>What do you do not like about the IDBP programme?</i>	The programme is currently limited only to a few provinces, not yet spreading all over Indonesia.
<b>Signature:</b> See Annex 2	<b>Date:</b> 16 February 2012

### Original evaluation form 3:

<b>Name:</b> Gofur	<b>Telephone:</b> +62 811 104 75 98
<b>Organisation:</b> Millenium Cooperation Challenge	<b>Email:</b> ngofur@yahoo.com
<i>What was your impression of the meeting?</i>	Very positive. It was attended by many stakeholders (CSO, private sector, implementers, donor and government). This indicates that biogas is needed and is important.



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

<i>What do you like about the IDBP programme?</i>	There are a number of benefits of the programme: (1) there are trickle-down effects (economic); (2) emission from methane is decreased; (3) the programme increases local people's capacity; (4) the programme increases environmental awareness at the local level.
<i>What do you do not like about the IDBP programme?</i>	None.
<b>Signature:</b> See Annex 2	<b>Date:</b> 16 February 2012

### Original evaluation form 4:

<b>Name:</b> Sri Saptaningsih	<b>Telephone:</b> +62 812 1058 4741
<b>Organisation:</b> Ministry of Environment	<b>Email:</b> saptalh@yahoo.com
<i>What was your impression of the meeting?</i>	It was very useful. The stakeholders were allowed to share their thoughts on biogas utilisation and development.
<i>What do you like about the IDBP programme?</i>	There are a number of benefits of the programme: (1) decrease of air and water pollution; (2) creation of job opportunities; (3) provision of alternative energy.
<i>What do you do not like about the IDBP programme?</i>	Please pay attention and follow up on the utilisation of the bio-slurry.
<b>Signature:</b> See Annex 2	<b>Date:</b> 16 February 2012

### *Comments accompanying Annex 2.*

The attendants of the LSC meeting gave positive remarks about the consultation, stating that it was a very useful event for sharing updates about IDBP progress and to promote IDBP itself to government and local stakeholders from other potential areas where IDBP has not gone to. The meeting was also appreciated because it brought together stakeholders from different fields; government of Indonesia, business and banking sector, local authorities and users and that it showed how biogas is necessary and needed.

The attendants also perceived IDBP as a very positive programme because it helps promoting cleaner new renewable energy, decreases air and water pollution, increases local capacity and awareness about environment, and from the economic perspective it provides trickle-down effect as it opens up new job opportunities for local people. One participant mentioned that he found out biogas is easy to use and has three Ps benefits: people, profit and planet.

Based on the evaluation, none of the attendants had a negative opinion about IDBP. They did, however, note that a few things should be improved, such as bio-slurry utilisation and the number of awareness meetings should be increased. One participant suggested that IDBP could explore utilization of other energy sources such as tofu waste and consider the construction of bigger size bio-digesters. Another participant thought that due to its subsidy policy, IDBP does not allow co-financing from provincial government, and another suggested that IDBP should really make use of cooperatives in terms of financial mobilisation, e.g. to provide credit access to potential users.

All of the above mentioned concerns were already discussed during the Question and Answer session. IDBP has started in 2012 to intensify bio-slurry utilisation amongst its user by conducting around 150 trainings for users. As IDBP is targeting ca. 5,000 new users in 2012, the number of

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

awareness meetings will also be increased. Regarding the bigger size bio-digesters that can also utilise tofu waste, IDBP is open to that kind of technology development although it has not yet become its primary goal. IDBP will consider it again and keep tracking biogas technology developments. For co-financing schemes with the government, IDBP in principle adheres to the existing development concept of limited subsidy, but will consider applying a more flexible policy in 2012, especially for vulnerable groups. In relation to the roles of cooperatives for financial mobilisation, IDBP has been making efforts not only to establish credit access from cooperatives to potential users, but also to connect the cooperatives with other financial institutions from which the cooperatives can get loans. IDBP will intensify these efforts in 2012, and beyond.

### C. 2. Pictures from physical meeting(s)

Picture 1 from the physical meeting:



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Picture 2 from the physical meeting:



Picture 3 from the physical meeting:



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Picture 4 from the physical meeting:



Picture 5 from the physical meeting:



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### C. 3. Outcome of consultation process

#### i. Minutes of physical meeting(s)

#### **LOCAL STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION MEETING ON GOLD STANDARD QUALIFICATION Jakarta, IBIS Tamarin Hotel, 16 February 2012**

##### **OPENING**

The Local Stakeholder Consultation Meeting was opened by Ms. Agi S. Cakradirana, Programme Development Officer and welcomed all participants from Jakarta and other provinces.

Ms. Agi S. Cakradirana requested all the participants to introduce themselves and to mention their place of origin as well as affiliated organisation.

The introduction was then followed by the rules of the game during the meeting/discussion in which participants were kindly asked to:

1. Turn off or silent mobile-phones
2. Be punctual at all discussions
3. Exit the room whenever receiving an incoming call during the discussion.

The programme then further continued with the Opening from Mr. Robert de Groot, Programme Manager the IDBP Programme.

Mr. De Groot conveyed that all participants attending this meeting represent the donors, local and national government, business partners, local representatives Gold Standard expert as well as colleagues from Hivos and welcomed all to the discussion.

Mr. De Groot then informed the participants that funding for the IDBP is uncertain despite the programme having the ambition to grow in scale. Mr. De Groot expressed hope that the biogas programme could be developed all across Indonesia.

\*\*\*\*\*

##### **1st SESSION : PRESENTATION**

##### **Developing a Sustainable Biogas Sector in Indonesia, by Robert de Groot**

In this presentation, Mr. De Groot described the main objectives of the IDBP programme as well as the benefits of having biogas as a renewable energy source.

*(Powerpoint presentation available upon request)*

\*\*\*\*\*

##### **2nd SESSION : PRESENTATION**

##### **The link between IDBP and National Energy Policy, by Maritje Hutapea**

In this presentation, Mrs. Maritje Hutapea described how the IDBP programme fits into Indonesia's national strategy for energy security and sustainable growth.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

(Powerpoint presentation available upon request)

\*\*\*\*\*

### 3rd SESSION : QUESTION & ANSWERS

See Section C.3.iii, below

For those who are not able to address their questions due to time limit, the facilitator welcomed the participants to write their concerns on the metaplan available.

\*\*\*\*\*

### 4th SESSION : PRESENTATION

#### Do Not Harm Assessment, by Ms Agi S. Cakradirana, Programme Development Officer

Ms. Cakradirana mentioned to the participants that in order to obtain the Gold Standard certification, Hivos has to undertake the “Do Not Harm” assessment. In principle, Hivos and IDBP ensure that when implementing the programme, it does not endanger the environment.

She further explained that the “Do Not Harm” assessment has 4 principles. Ms. Cakradirana described each of the principles and mentioned each of the scoring for risks that might impact the human and environment aspects. In summary, the risks for all the mentioned principles were presented as low, and thus not harmful.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### Questions and Comments

See Section C.3.iii, below

\*\*\*\*\*

### 5th SESSION : DISCUSSION

#### SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (Indonesian Development Biogas Programme)

Facilitator : Agi S. Cakradirana

Ms. Cakradirana emphasised that this exercise must be carried out by the programme in line with Gold Standard guidelines and must actively involve the participants of the meeting. She welcomed participants to provide their comments and scorings for each of the twelve indicators.

The result for the scorings is listed below:

No.	Indicators	Score
1.	Quality of water	Positive
2.	Quantity and quantity of air	Positive
3.	Condition of soil	Positive
4.	Other pollutants	Positive
5.	Biodiversity	Positive
6.	Quality of employment	Positive
7.	Livelihood of the poor	Positive
8.	Access to affordable and clean energy services	Positive

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

9.	Human and institutional capacity	Positive
10.	Quantitative employment and income generation	Positive
11.	Balance of payments and investment	Neutral
12.	Technology transfer and technical self-reliance	Positive

\*\*\*\*\*

### 6th SESSION : DISCUSSION

#### Future monitoring

Facilitator : Agi S. Cakradirana

The facilitator invited the participants to provide their comments and inputs on better future monitoring for the IDBP programme.

Some of the inputs and comments are as follows:

- 1) To provide a pool of information through inputs from participants, bulleting and e-mail.
- 2) Provide on-line as well as off-line forums for biogas discussion, and encourage it to the community since access to information is still low.
- 3) Spread the research results in order to gain stronger understanding and ownership
- 4) There should be a better effort to assist the biogas beneficiaries in establishing a business plan. There should be a transfer of knowledge, build cooperation with NGOs etc.
- 5) There are many success stories therefore these stories should be formulated and brought forward to the central and local government so that biogas can be encouraged and recommended in a structural manner.
- 6) Hivos owns a strong database of baseline data. The baseline should be published on the website and distributed to stakeholders for their knowledge.
- 7) Conduct a periodic evaluation in order to indicate the strength and weakness and accelerate the development.
- 8) A need to improve Hivos' technology as the current one is not yet finalised.
- 9) Publish success stories generated under the IDBP.
- 10) Determine an APBD regulation for further funding.

The facilitator also shared with the participants, the mechanism on how to access information on biogas, through these channels as below:

- 1) website : [www.biru.or.id](http://www.biru.or.id)
- 2) Hotline: 0812-8030-2020
- 3) Message Book at the IDBP's Provincial Office
- 4) Regular Meeting

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

The facilitator then mentioned that a feedback round following the meeting will take place, during which all participants will receive insight into the finalised meeting documents and will be able to see how their comments have been incorporated.

At the end of the meeting, the facilitator encouraged participants to complete the Evaluation Form and to return it to the administration desk.

**Meeting adjourned at 14:00 hours.**

### ii. Minutes of other consultations

Not applicable.

### iii. Assessment of all comments

Stakeholder comment	Yes/ No?	Explanation (Why? How?)
<p><b>Q1:</b> <i>How long is the period during which a user is required to repay the biodigester purchase? What does the subsidy mechanism look like? When does the user get the return of investment, in terms of fishery and agricultural benefits?</i></p>	Yes	<p><b>A1:</b> The benefits of biogas may not be apparent immediately for the user, because the user must invest a considerable amount of money upfront, and not every user is ready to do this. For instance, a user who is ready to invest in a biodigester through credit will need to spend IDR150,000 (around EUR 12.00) as a monthly instalment for three years. The user usually repays the instalment to their cooperative in cash, or in the form of milk price deduction that is paid by the cooperative to the user.</p>
<p><b>Q2:</b> <i>The biogas development is currently implemented in some parts of Indonesia only. Can it be implemented nationwide? From the side of the government, the need for new renewable energy is increasing. Unfortunately, inadequate action is occurring on this front.</i></p>	Yes	<p><b>A2:</b> The target for biogas implementation is not limited to the initial set of provinces only, but all of Indonesia. However, as this is only the initial stage of the biogas programme and the responsibility to implement biogas programme does not solely rely on the central government. That is why provincial governments are invited to this kind of meetings, so that they can share the result of the meetings to the other local authorities. The provincial government can allocate a part of their budget for biogas development. IDBP expects to expand into Sumatra island, because it has a lot of potential. At this stage, MCC also already stated that they are interested to do a pilot project in Jambi, therefore IDBP will also explore about the next working areas with MCC. It is expected that in the future there will be increasingly more provinces</p>



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		where biogas is implemented.
<p><b>Q3:</b> <i>In Central Java, the electrification ratio is 76.63%. Many hamlets still do not have access to electricity. The awareness meetings about biogas benefits are really needed. The level of awareness of the people is still low; therefore collaboration between the provincial and the central government as well as Hivos is necessary.</i></p>	Yes	<p><b>A3:</b> Technically, it is possible to convert biogas into electricity, but it requires high biogas input. It should also be remembered that the gas quality from biogas – in unprocessed conditions - contains a high level of sulphur and water particles thus making it corrosive to the appliances.</p>
<p><b>Q4:</b> <i>Can IDBP build bigger size bio-digesters, such as 20 m3, and make it not limited to cattle manure but also use it for tempeh waste? There are demo plots done by other stakeholders in some areas in Central Java that make use of tempeh waste.</i></p>	Yes	<p><b>A4:</b> IDBP has been thinking about bigger biogas digester, and there is a possibility of building bigger biogas digester systems in 2012 (between 20 m3 and 50 m3). Currently, IDBP still focuses on domestic biogas, which is for the household. IDBP will consider it again, as it is also related with the interest of the programme and SNV as the technical partner. IDBP will keep tracking biogas technology developments.</p>
<p><b>Q5:</b> <i>Can the level of IDBP subsidy rate be increased? For instance, the subsidy for small size biodigester is IDR 2 million (around EUR 170), but can bigger sized biodigesters qualify for a higher subsidy rate?</i></p>	Yes	<p><b>A5:</b> IDBP does not intend to change the subsidy rate because the digester size should match with the user's need for biogas. For instance, a user who has 4 to 5 family members and owns 10 cows could build but does not need a 8 m3 biodigester, because the energy need for the whole family will be met with a 6 m3 digester. By providing a flat subsidy rate, IDBP encourages people to use the energy as efficient as possible.</p>
<p><b>Q6:</b> <i>There are 1,500 dairy farmers in Tandangsari, Sumedang, West Java. Only 40 of them have biogas. At the moment, the dairy cow market is not good. The fodder price is increasing, living cost is also increasing and the economy in general is not good. How can we increase the dairy cow market like in Malaysia?</i></p>	No	<p><b>A6:</b> Irrelevant to IDBP.</p>

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

<p><b>Q7:</b> In 2005, the Indonesian government adopted a target to increase the use of new renewable energy up to 17%. In Buru Island, Maluku, cattle rearing is done extensively, and the cattle are kept in a communal stable. Can we extend the IDBP programme to Maluku? Furthermore, If we want to promote biogas, how can we explain to the farmers to make use of the manure (that can be used as biogas and bio-slurry)? Because often the farmers bring the manure to the field, mix it with hay and then burn it. Is it possible to build a centralised biogas plant there?</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p><b>A7:</b> Communal stable for cattle is a common practice. In the case of Buru Island, the energy access can be integrated with that agricultural system. It is in the best interest of IDBP to ensure that the users can get optimum benefits from biogas. Therefore, although it is known that communal systems often do not work very well due to social factors (technically it is feasible), the IDBP is considering building a number of communal plants, so manure of these communities can be used for biogas and eventually for fertiliser. As for centralised biogas, it depends on the distance between the stable and the houses. In principle, a biogas digester can be built up to 100 meters from the house(s). Maluku may be considered in the later stage of the programme if adequate funding is available.</p>
<p><b>Q8:</b> Biogas is already present in South Sulawesi. The IDBP is very good there. In South Sulawesi, the electrification rate is 85%, therefore biogas is needed. There are 1 million cattle in South Sulawesi. The target is to increase the number up to 2 million. However, the achievement to build biogas is still difficult because there is no credit access. So it is suggested that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The subsidy should be given from the government (from the provincial budget);</li> <li>2. The number of trainings for biogas should be increased as well. The provincial government could finance this;</li> </ol> <p>Biogas appliances should only be obtained locally, from Indonesia.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p><b>A8:</b> There are many other sources of energy that can increase the electrification level, such as micro hydro, solar, geothermal. Biogas is certainly only one of them. The provincial government is welcome to use their own budget to develop the biogas sector employing the concept of IDBP, with a focus on strengthening biogas service providers through training. Credit access is one of IDBP's biggest challenges. Local governments are welcome to play a role in enhancing access to credit. As for locally made biogas appliances, it should be remembered that it is crucial to maintain the quality of the biodigesters. Until now, all but one of the appliances are already made locally. The local main gas valve does still not meet IDBP quality standards. IDBP keeps on looking for local manufacturers, including local workshops and technical schools. Until there is a good quality of locally-made appliances, IDBP will only use imported ones to maintain the quality.</p>
<p><b>Q9:</b> What does the carbon trade look like? What will happen with the carbon credit?</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p><b>A9:</b> The carbon trade is aimed at obtaining revenues, which are subsequently pumped back into the programme. Hivos will have the responsibility to ensure that the programme's</p>

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		carbon credits are sold on the carbon market and will also have the responsibility to meet monitoring demands resulting from the carbon mechanism under the Gold Standard. Hivos has initiated the development of the mechanism as it sees IDBP as a long-term programme which will in the long run result in considerable carbon emission reductions, which will support the programme financially and make it self-reliant, reducing the need of external funding.
<b>Q10:</b> <i>The central government is actively promoting the biogas programme, but there is a lack of coordination with the provincial government. Not to mention that there is still a programme that builds biogas by using grants (fully-subsidized biodigesters). The grant system is ruining the market. The central and provincial government must have one policy only. The collaboration must be intensified. What will the central government do post-2012 in this respect?</i>	Yes	<b>A10:</b> It is true that there still exist communication problems between the provincial and central government. This is because the provincial government has the freedom to make their own plans. However, the central government always tries to coordinate in relation to biogas development with the provincial government. At the moment the central government intends to work on a regulation framework in the form of a Ministerial Decree so that the National Budget can be used for subsidy.
<b>Q11:</b> <i>What can be done to ensure that there is no problem in operation and maintenance of a communal biodigester?</i>	Yes	<b>A11:</b> The owners of IDBP biodigesters are thoroughly trained, ensuring that they understand how to handle their plant, but they will also get after sales services to ensure that the systems are kept operational. In the case of communal systems this will also be done and the communal aspects will be given special attention to make sure that the group manages their plant jointly in the right way.
<b>Q12.</b> <i>Some farmers still dispose bio-slurry to the gutter and river thereby polluting the water and destroying the environment. Does IDBP have any training to provide to biodigester users so that they know the advantages of the bio-slurry?</i>	Yes	<b>A13.</b> As part of the IDBP programme, biogas users are entitled to receive knowledge on the advantages of bio-slurry. The programme intensively cooperate with its business partner, herein KBSS Setia Kawan, to ensure that all users should receive the training accordingly.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### iv. Revisit sustainability assessment (to be assessed per Methodology/technology/practice)

Are you going to revisit the sustainable development assessment?	Yes	No
Please note that this is necessary when there are indicators scored 'negative' or if there are stakeholder comments that can't be mitigated		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

*Reasoning behind the decision:* There is no need to revisit the sustainability assessment as no negative scores were assigned during the LSC meeting and the evaluation forms did not feature any negative comments.

### v. Summary of alterations based on comments

Hivos understands and fully agrees with all the comments received. IDBP already pro-actively pursues all of the mentioned areas of operations to which the comments relate. IDBP will continue its active work on all these fronts to further improve the reach, effectiveness and customer satisfaction of the programme. Alterations to the programme design based on the comments received are therefore not required.

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### SECTION D. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT (to be done per Methodology/technology/practice)

#### D.1. Own sustainable development assessment (to be done per Methodology/technology/practice)

##### i. 'Do no harm' assessment

The DNH Assessment is done on the Programme level. This assessment pertains to the biodigester technology which is the only technology applied across all project activities.

Safeguarding principles	Description of relevance to my programme	Assessment of risk (low / medium / high)	Mitigation measure
<i>Human Rights</i>			
1.	The programme encourages the construction and operation biodigesters fed by livestock manure at the households, local communities and SMEs. It therefore improves the quality of life of users through the provision of clean, renewable energy nationwide. The installation of biodigesters relies on individual voluntarily investment in a biodigester at a discounted rate. The voluntary nature of this purchase ensures that the individual dignity, cultural property and uniqueness of indigenous peoples are respected.	Low	Not applicable
2.	The programme does not impose any need for involuntary resettlement.	Low	Not applicable
3.	Under the programme, biodigesters are installed directly adjacent to the user on a voluntary basis, and no damage or removal of any critical cultural heritage will take place.	Low	Not applicable
<i>Labour Standards</i>			
4.	The programme generates employment for locally trained contractors and masons to carry out the dissemination, installation and maintenance of the biodigesters. The programme respects these employees' freedom of association and their right to collective bargaining.	Low	Not applicable
5.	All those employed by the programme are	Low	Not applicable

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	adults, who are voluntarily engaging in the support of the included project activities through legal employment.		
6.	All those employed by the programme are adults who are voluntarily engaging in the support of the project through legal employment. No forms of child labour are tolerated.	Low	Not applicable
7.	The programme is all-inclusive, installing biodigesters at users with two or more cattle. Additionally, the programme is co-managed by Hivos, an organisation which has an expertise and track record in ensuring discriminatory behaviour is not tolerated. As a result, all eligible users are included in the programme, regardless of gender, race, religion, sexual orientation or any other basis. The programme helps to increase gender equality through reducing the time needed for biomass/fuel collection. This is traditionally a woman's role, thereby allowing them to spend more time on other activities.	Low	Not applicable
8.	The programme involves the installation of biodigesters ranging from 4m <sup>3</sup> to 50m <sup>3</sup> . It employs trained contractors and masons, who are supported by IDBP ensuring that installation of the biodigesters is done in a safe manner and minimises risk to workers. The programme does not expose workers to unsafe or unhealthy work environments.	Low	Not applicable
<i>Environmental Protection</i>			
9.	The programme takes a precautionary approach with regard to environmental challenges and is not complicit in practices contrary to the precautionary principle. The programme helps to reduce threats or harm to human health through reducing smoke inhalation at the users' premises, diverting manure from entering water ways and promoting the use of organic fertiliser (digester slurry) over manufactured fertilisers, thereby also reducing damage to the local environment whilst increasing crop productivity.	Low	Not applicable

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

10.	The programme does not involve and is not complicit in the conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats. Furthermore, the use of biogas helps to reduce the use of firewood, thereby containing deforestation in the project areas.	Low	Not applicable
<i>Anti-corruption</i>			
11.	All transactions, including subsidy disbursement, are recorded and carried out in a transparent and traceable manner. Accounting by an external third party occurs on an annual basis. All financial transactions are available to project beneficiaries and legal authorities. The programme thereby minimises the possibility of corruption occurring within its scope of operation.	Low	Not applicable
No additional critical issues were identified.			

### ii. Sustainable development matrix

The SD Assessment is done on the Programme level. This assessment pertains to the biogas technology which is the only technology applied across all project activities. Below is a presentation of the initial version of the Sustainable Development matrix drafted by Hivos before the LSC meeting took place.

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
<i>Environment</i>				
Air quality	None necessary	<i>MDG 5: Improve maternal health</i>  The programme reduces indoor air pollution through the implementation of the biogas technology.	There can be a positive impact on the air quality through a reduction of indoor air pollution, thereby improving general health conditions at the users' premises. This is however difficult to assess directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.	0

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Water quality and quantity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to environmental sustainability by limiting the amount of manure dumping in local waterways, hereby preventing ground water contamination</p>	<p>There can be a positive impact on environmental sustainability through a reduction of manure dumping into local waterways, thereby reducing ground water contamination. This is however difficult to assess directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.</p>	0
Soil condition	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme reduces the need for artificial fertilisers, which are more harmful to the environmental integrity than organic fertilisers.</p> <p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>Use of digester slurry generated under the programme on agricultural soils increases soil fertility and improves crop harvest. The additional yield can either be consumed or sold.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Continuous harvesting of land causes deterioration of soil conditions. Only the better-off users can afford to purchase artificial fertiliser, which is becoming increasingly more expensive. This means harvest is not optimal.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Application of final biogester slurry on agricultural fields, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The application of sludge increases the organic content and fertility of soils, thereby increasing crop yields.</p>	+
Other pollutants	None necessary	No other pollutants are identified	No other pollutants are identified	0



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Biodiversity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to the containment of deforestation and forest degradation due to substitution of non-renewable biomass with renewable energy.</p>	<p>There can be a positive impact on biodiversity through a reduction in deforestation due to a reduced dependence on firewood. This is however difficult to assess directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.</p>	0
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+1</b>
<i>Social Development</i>				
Quality of employment	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme provides quality training in line with IDBP quality standards, thereby generating quality employment helping to reduce poverty.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Proportion of employees attending vocational training programs, as proven through issuance of a certificate to all masons, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Those attending the trainings will acquire technical skills and knowledge.</p>	+
Livelihood of the poor	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme helps to alleviate poverty through the creation of employment. Users will have a lower annual expenditure due to a reduced need to purchase non-renewable biomass, fossil fuels and artificial fertilisers, therefore leaving more income available for other purposes (eg. healthcare). Reduced smoke inhalation also</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Health issues related to respiratory diseases are occurring. Additionally, users, and especially women, experience limited available time due to the need to invest time in firewood collection and cooking.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Improvement of living conditions in terms of health benefits, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Improved perceived health conditions by the user are an indication of improved livelihood of the poor.</p>	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		improves respiratory health.		
Access to affordable and clean energy services	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1; MDG 5; MDG 7:</i></p> <p>The programme helps to reduce poverty through reducing fuel purchasing costs; better indoor air quality reduces maternal and child respiratory stress; reduction in use of non-renewable biomass as a fuel helps to reduce deforestation and forest degradation locally.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Combustion of LPG, kerosene and firewood lead to particulate matter and carbon monoxide pollution and deforestation, and therefore do not provide clean energy services. Also, prices of all fuels are increasing, presenting a rising financial burden to users.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Number of biogas units installed, in use and operating, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The number of operational and in-use biogas units indicates that the programme has successfully promoted access to affordable and clean energy services, increased users' general wellbeing and contributed to the containment of deforestation and forest degradation.</p>	+
Human and institutional capacity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</i></p> <p>The programme supports gender equality by freeing up women's time that can be dedicated to other beneficial activities.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Women spend much of their time collecting firewood and cooking, and have little spare time to undertake activities that stimulate personal and entrepreneurial development.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level promotes gender equality by freeing up valuable time for women, who are generally in charge of collecting firewood.</p>	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+4</b>
<i>Economic and technological development</i>				
Quantitative employment and income	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: 1B: Achieve decent employment for</i></p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities currently exist in the target</p>	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

generation		<p>women, men and young people</p> <p>The programme creates employment opportunities and provides trainings, to date directly employing 53 persons while engaging another 475 certified masons in the construction process. As the programme grows through time, the quantitative employment rate will increase.</p>	<p>regions outside of farming.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Number of jobs generated by within the IDBP as well as the number of masons employed, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The number of jobs created under the programme indicates quantitative employment and income generation benefits.</p>	
Balance of payments and investment	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i></p> <p>The programme facilitates foreign investment in Indonesia through the integration of ODA finance.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited and geographically constrained foreign capital dedicated to the domestic biogas market.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Quantity of foreign revenue invested in the programme in terms of ODA or other financial means.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Indicates a change compared to the baseline in the investment into a technology (in this case biodigesters)</p>	+
Technology transfer and technical self-reliance	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i></p> <p>The programme promotes knowledge sharing to realise domestic implementation of quality standard biodigesters. Training provided to masons builds on best case practices gathered from projects operational</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training opportunities and transfer of technology in the biogas sector, both on the mason and user levels.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Number of masons trained and users attending the operation and maintenance training, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The programme builds vocational knowledge in the domestic biogas sector, which was previously absent. This increases technical self-</p>	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		elsewhere in the world.	reliance.	
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+3</b>
				<b>+8</b>

No further comments apply.

### D. 2. Stakeholders Blind sustainable development matrix

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
<i>Environment</i>				
Air quality	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 5: Improve maternal health</i></p> <p>The programme reduces indoor air pollution through the implementation of the biodigester technology.</p>	The participants of the LSC meeting agreed that the impact on air quality is likely to be positive. However, when asked about how the stakeholders could assist with the monitoring of this impact, or how this could be achieved in a cost-effective way, no consensus was reached.	+
Water quality and quantity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to environmental sustainability by limiting the amount of manure dumping in local waterways, hereby preventing ground water contamination</p>	The participants of the LSC meeting agreed that the impact on water quality is likely to be positive. However, when asked about how the stakeholders could assist with the monitoring of this impact, or how this could be achieved in a cost-effective way, no consensus was reached.	+
Soil condition	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme</p>	<u>Baseline:</u> Continuous harvesting of land causes deterioration of soil conditions. Only the better-off users can afford to purchase artificial fertiliser, which is	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		<p>reduces the need for artificial fertilisers, which are more harmful to the environmental integrity than organic fertilisers.</p> <p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>Use of digester slurry generated under the programme on agricultural soils increases soil fertility and improves crop harvest. The additional yield can either be consumed or sold.</p>	<p>becoming increasingly more expensive. This means harvest is not optimal.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Application of final biodigester slurry on agricultural fields, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The application of sludge increases the organic content and fertility of soils, thereby increasing crop yields.</p>	
Other pollutants	None necessary	No other pollutants are identified	The participants of the LSC meeting agreed that the lack of other pollutants is a positive feature of the programme. However, when asked about how the stakeholders could assist with the monitoring of this impact, or how this could be achieved in a cost-effective way, no consensus was reached.	+
Biodiversity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to the containment of deforestation and forest degradation due to substitution of non-renewable biomass with renewable energy.</p>	The participants of the LSC meeting agreed that the impact on biodiversity is likely to be positive. However, when asked about how the stakeholders could assist with the monitoring of this impact, or how this could be achieved in a cost-effective way, no consensus was reached.	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+5</b>
<i>Social Development</i>				

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Quality of employment	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme provides quality training in line with IDBP quality standards, thereby generating quality employment helping to reduce poverty.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Proportion of employees attending vocational training programs, as proven through issuance of a certificate to all masons, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Those attending the trainings will acquire technical skills and knowledge.</p>	+
Livelihood of the poor	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme helps to alleviate poverty through the creation of employment. Users typically have a lower annual expenditure due to a reduced need to purchase non-renewable biomass, fossil fuels and artificial fertilisers, therefore leaving more income available for other purposes (eg. healthcare). Reduced smoke inhalation also improves respiratory health.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Health issues related to respiratory diseases are occurring. Additionally, users, and especially women, experience limited available time due to the need to invest time in firewood collection and cooking.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Improvement of living conditions in terms of health benefits, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Improved perceived health conditions by the users are an indication of improved livelihood of the poor.</p>	+
Access to affordable and clean energy services	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1; MDG 5; MDG 7:</i></p> <p>The programme helps to reduce poverty through reducing fuel purchasing costs; better indoor air quality reduces maternal and child respiratory stress; reduction in use of non-renewable</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Combustion of LPG, kerosene and firewood lead to particulate matter and carbon monoxide pollution and deforestation, and therefore do not provide clean energy services. Also, prices of all fuels are increasing, presenting a rising financial burden to users.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Number of biogas units installed, in use and operating, collected by the IDBP database.</p>	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		biomass as a fuel helps to reduce deforestation and forest degradation locally.	<u>Explanation:</u> The number of operational and in-use biogas units indicates that the programme has successfully promoted access to affordable and clean energy services, increased users' general wellbeing and contributed to the containment of deforestation and forest degradation.	
Human and institutional capacity	None necessary	<i>MDG 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</i>  The programme supports gender equality by freeing up women's time that can be dedicated to other beneficial activities.	<u>Baseline:</u> Women spend much of their time collecting firewood and cooking, and have little spare time to undertake activities that stimulate personal and entrepreneurial development.  <u>Parameter:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.  <u>Explanation:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level promotes gender equality by freeing up valuable time for women, who are generally in charge of collecting firewood.	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+4</b>
<i>Economic and technological development</i>				
Quantitative employment and income generation	None necessary	<i>MDG 1: 1B: Achieve decent employment for women, men and young people</i>  The programme creates employment opportunities and provides trainings, to date directly employing 53 persons while engaging another 475 certified masons in the construction process. As the	<u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities currently exist in the target regions outside of farming.  <u>Parameter:</u> Number of jobs generated by within the IDBP as well as the number of masons employed, collected by the IDBP database.  <u>Explanation:</u> The number of jobs created under the programme indicates quantitative employment and income generation benefits.	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		programme grows through time, the quantitative employment rate will increase.		
Balance of payments and investment	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i></p> <p>The programme facilitates foreign investment in Indonesia through the integration of ODA finance.</p>	As indicated by the participants of the LSC meeting, it is difficult to prove the positive impact of the programme on the balance of payments and investments. The impact is therefore assumed to be neutral.	0
Technology transfer and technical self-reliance	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i></p> <p>The programme promotes knowledge sharing to realise domestic implementation of quality standard biodigesters. Training provided to masons builds on best case practices gathered from projects operational elsewhere in the world.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training opportunities and transfer of technology in the biogas sector, both on the mason and user levels.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Number of masons trained and users attending the operation and maintenance training, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The programme builds vocational knowledge in the domestic biogas sector, which was previously absent. This increases technical self-reliance.</p>	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+2</b>
				<b>+11</b>

The facilitator was in charge of leading the participants of the LSC meeting through the 'blind exercise'. Prior to initiating the discussion, the rules of the exercise were explained, noting that after the introductory talk of the facilitator explaining each of the indicators, the group of participants had 10 minutes to reach consensus whether the impact of the programme was negative, neutral or positive.

The actual exercise went quicker than planned as on all but one point there was unanimous decision by the stakeholders that the impacts of the programme are positive. Only for indicator 11 (balance of payments and investment) a decision was reached that a neutral impact is most suitable. No negative impacts of the programme were identified, therefore omitting the need for a revisit of the Sustainable Development matrix.



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

Give analysis of difference between own sustainable development matrix and the one resulting from the blind exercise with stakeholders. Explain how both were consolidated.

Neither the own Sustainable Development matrix nor the matrix agreed upon by the participants of the LSC meeting featured any negative score. There were a number of differences concerning the assessment of whether several indicators have a positive or rather neutral impact. These included the following indicators:

Indicator	Own SD assessment	LSC SD assessment
Air quality	Neutral	Positive
Water quality and quantity	Neutral	Positive
Other pollutants	Neutral	Positive
Biodiversity	Neutral	Positive
Balance of payments and investment	Positive	Neutral

The participants of the LSC meeting agreed that the impact on air and water quality, other pollutants and biodiversity is likely to be positive. However, when asked about how the stakeholders could assist with the monitoring of these impacts, or how this could be achieved in a cost-effective way, no consensus was reached. Therefore, to be conservative, the Consolidated Sustainable Development matrix features a neutral score for all five indicators.

This consolidated matrix, alongside the argumentation provided in this section, will be shared with the stakeholders during the Feedback Round. Stakeholder will therefore receive insight into the final proposed matrix and will be given the opportunity to comment on its makeup.

### D. 3. Consolidated sustainable development matrix

Indicator	Mitigation measure	Relevance to achieving MDG	Chosen parameter and explanation	Preliminary score
<i>Environment</i>				
Air quality	None necessary	<i>MDG 5: Improve maternal health</i>  The programme reduces indoor air pollution through the implementation of the biodigester technology.	As indicated by the participants of the LSC meeting, there can be a positive impact on the air quality through a reduction of indoor air pollution, thereby improving general health conditions at the users' premises. This is however difficult to assess directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.	0
Water quality	None	<i>MDG 7: Ensure</i>	As indicated by the participants	0

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

and quantity	necessary	<p><i>environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to environmental sustainability by limiting the amount of manure dumping in local waterways, hereby preventing ground water contamination</p>	<p>of the LSC meeting, there can be a positive impact on environmental sustainability through a reduction of manure dumping into local waterways, thereby reducing ground water contamination. This is however difficult to assess directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.</p>	
Soil condition	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme reduces the need for artificial fertilisers, which are more harmful to the environmental integrity than organic fertilisers.</p> <p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>Use of digester slurry generated under the programme on agricultural soils increases soil fertility and improves crop harvest. The additional yield can either be consumed or sold.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Continuous harvesting of land causes deterioration of soil conditions. Only the better-off users can afford to purchase artificial fertiliser, which is becoming increasingly more expensive. This means harvest is not optimal.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Application of final biogas slurry on agricultural fields, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> The application of sludge increases the organic content and fertility of soils, thereby increasing crop yields.</p>	+
Other pollutants	None necessary	No other pollutants are identified	No other pollutants are identified	0
Biodiversity	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</i></p> <p>The programme contributes to the containment of</p>	<p>As indicated by the participants of the LSC meeting, there can be a positive impact on biodiversity through a reduction in deforestation due to a reduced dependence on firewood. This is however difficult to assess</p>	0

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		deforestation and forest degradation due to substitution of non-renewable biomass with renewable energy.	directly and will therefore not be monitored as part of this programme.	
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+1</b>
<i>Social Development</i>				
Quality of employment	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme provides quality training in line with IDBP quality standards, thereby generating quality employment helping to reduce poverty.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Proportion of employees attending vocational training programs, as proven through issuance of a certificate to all masons, collected by the IDBP database.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Those attending the trainings will acquire technical skills and knowledge.</p>	+
Livelihood of the poor	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</i></p> <p>The programme helps to alleviate poverty through the creation of employment. Users will have a lower annual expenditure due to a reduced need to purchase non-renewable biomass, fossil fuels and artificial fertilisers, therefore leaving more income available for other purposes (eg. healthcare). Reduced smoke inhalation also improves respiratory health.</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Health issues related to respiratory diseases are occurring. Additionally, users, and especially women, experience limited available time due to the need to invest time in firewood collection and cooking.</p> <p><u>Parameter:</u> Improvement of living conditions in terms of health benefits, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.</p> <p><u>Explanation:</u> Improved perceived health conditions by the users are an indication of improved livelihood of the poor.</p>	+
Access to affordable and clean energy	None necessary	<p><i>MDG 1; MDG 5; MDG 7:</i></p> <p>The programme</p>	<p><u>Baseline:</u> Combustion of LPG, kerosene and firewood lead to particulate matter and carbon monoxide pollution and</p>	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

services		helps to reduce poverty through reducing fuel purchasing costs; better indoor air quality reduces maternal and child respiratory stress; reduction in use of non-renewable biomass as a fuel helps to reduce deforestation and forest degradation locally.	deforestation, and therefore do not provide clean energy services. Also, prices of all fuels are increasing, presenting a rising financial burden to users.  <u>Parameter:</u> Number of biogas units installed, in use and operating, collected by the IDBP database.  <u>Explanation:</u> The number of operational and in-use biogas units indicates that the programme has successfully promoted access to affordable and clean energy services, increased users' general wellbeing and contributed to the containment of deforestation and forest degradation.	
Human and institutional capacity	None necessary	<i>MDG 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</i>  The programme supports gender equality by freeing up women's time that can be dedicated to other beneficial activities.	<u>Baseline:</u> Women spend much of their time collecting firewood and cooking, and have little spare time to undertake activities that stimulate personal and entrepreneurial development.  <u>Parameter:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level, collected through the annual Biogas User Survey.  <u>Explanation:</u> Saving time in collecting firewood on the user level promotes gender equality by freeing up valuable time for women, who are generally in charge of collecting firewood.	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+4</b>
<i>Economic and technological development</i>				
Quantitative employment and income generation	None necessary	<i>MDG 1: 1B: Achieve decent employment for women, men and young people</i>  The programme creates employment	<u>Baseline:</u> Limited training and employment opportunities currently exist in the target regions outside of farming.  <u>Parameter:</u> Number of jobs generated by within the IDBP as well as the number of masons employed, collected by the IDBP	+

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

		opportunities and provides trainings, to date directly employing 53 persons while engaging another 475 certified masons in the construction process. As the programme grows through time, the quantitative employment rate will increase.	database.  <u>Explanation:</u> The number of jobs created under the programme indicates quantitative employment and income generation benefits.	
Balance of payments and investment	None necessary	<i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i>  The programme facilitates foreign investment in Indonesia through the integration of ODA finance.	As indicated by the participants of the LSC meeting, it is difficult to prove the positive impact of the programme on the balance of payments and investments. The impact is therefore assumed to be neutral.	0
Technology transfer and technical self-reliance	None necessary	<i>MDG 8: Develop a global partnership for development</i>  The programme promotes knowledge sharing to realise domestic implementation of quality standard biodigesters. Training provided to masons builds on best case practices gathered from projects operational elsewhere in the world.	<u>Baseline:</u> Limited training opportunities and transfer of technology in the biogas sector, both on the mason and user levels.  <u>Parameter:</u> Number of masons trained and users attending the operation and maintenance training, collected by the IDBP database.  <u>Explanation:</u> The programme builds vocational knowledge in the domestic biogas sector, which was previously absent. This increases technical self-reliance.	+
<b>Total Score:</b>				<b>+2</b>
				<b>+7</b>
<b>Justification choices, data source and provision of references</b>				
Air quality	In the baseline scenario the use of biomass and fossil fuels for user cooking leads to considerable contamination of the indoor			

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	environment with particulate matter and carbon monoxide (CO), causing respiratory health problems. This is confirmed by numerous sources <sup>1</sup> . Resulting respiratory health problems are a serious issue on across the globe. Recent statistics indicate that in 2004, indoor air pollution resulting from the combustion of solid and fossil fuels was responsible for an estimated 2 million deaths worldwide <sup>2</sup> . As it is difficult for IDBP to prove the exact positive impact the programme has on air quality, it is assumed to be neutral.
Water quality and quantity	Diverting livestock waste to the biodigesters implemented under each VPA can have a positive effect on the quality of water ways due to a reduced prevalence of manure disposal in water ways. However, since this has not been established as a dominant form of disposal the effect is considered minor. Additionally, reduced indoor combustion of fossil fuels and biomass will result in a cleaner premise, and therefore less use of water for cleaning at user level. But since the biodigesters require the addition of water the impact on the quantity of water used is also considered to be neutral.
Soil condition	The biodigesters implemented under each VPA will produce slurry as part of the anaerobic digestion of waste. This slurry has a higher fertility than direct application of manure to the field <sup>3</sup> and is provided free of charge to users as a bi-product of biogas production. In many cases across Indonesia the purchase of chemical fertilisers is not financially feasible for users, and soils can become degraded due to continued harvests <sup>4</sup> . The application of slurry to agricultural soils can therefore help to improve soil condition through increasing organic content. As it is difficult for IDBP to prove the exact positive impact the programme has on soil conditions, it is assumed to be neutral.
Other pollutants	No other pollutants are identified. This indicator is therefore assumed to be neutral.
Biodiversity	Current local rates of forest destruction exceed the maximum replacement rate, leading to deforestation and forest degradation. A recent study provides detailed insight into the rates of deforestation in Indonesia between 1990 and 2005 <sup>5</sup> . During that period, 21.32 million ha of forest had been cleared, which represents 17.6% of total national coverage. This is a strong indication that removal of forests in an unsustainably manner is occurring rapidly, and open forest and

<sup>1</sup> GTZ. Biogas Digest – Volume III. Available at: <http://www.gtz.de/de/dokumente/en-biogas-volume3.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> WHO (2010) Health in the green economy: Co-benefits to health of climate change mitigation. Available at: [http://www.who.int/hia/hgebrief\\_henergy.pdf](http://www.who.int/hia/hgebrief_henergy.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> See for example: Kurchania, A.K. and Panwar, N.L. (2011) Experimental investigation of an applicator of liquid slurry, from biogas production, for crop production, *Environmental Technology*, 32 (8), p. 873 – 878.

<sup>4</sup> Stott, D.E., Mohtar R.H, and Steinhardt, G.C (2001) Sustaining the Global Farm: Rainfall-runoff harvesting for controlling erosion and sustaining upland agriculture development. p. 431-439.

<sup>5</sup> Hansen, M.C. *et al.* (2009) Quantifying changes in the rates of forest clearing in Indonesia from 1990 to 2005 using remotely sensed data sets. *Environmental Research Letters*

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	scrub coverage are decreasing with high rate of depletion. A report published by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) attributes part of the deforestation to firewood collection by households <sup>6</sup> . As it is difficult for IDBP to prove the exact positive impact the programme has on biodiversity, it is assumed to be neutral.
Quality of employment	Each VPA aims to install 1,000s of biodigesters and will require constructing and monitoring effort by local staff. Each VPA shall create quality, permanent job opportunities. All staff will be supported by vocational training sessions supported by the programme. On completion of these trainings, all attendees will receive a certificate proving their attendance and skills gained.
Livelihood of the poor	<p>Each VPA shall improve the livelihood of the poor through reducing user energy costs in the long term and freeing up time for other income generating activities through a reduced need to spend time collecting firewood. Users on average spend IDR 120,000 (EUR 100) on cooking fuels per year or an average of 20 hours collecting firewood per week<sup>7</sup>. This is particularly relevant for women, whose role it is traditionally to collect firewood<sup>8</sup>. Additionally, since women tend to constitute the larger percentage of those living in poverty<sup>9</sup>, each project activity shall also help to promote gender equality through the active employment of women. This will also benefit the programme as a whole since women, as the primary users of cooking fuels, will be more effective at marketing the biogas installations, and associated cook stoves, to other women.</p> <p>Each VPA shall also benefit the quality of life of the poor, particularly women and children, through improved health (less smoke inhalation), less time spent on cleaning soot from the user, collecting fuel and cooking. This will free up time for other activities.</p>
Access to affordable and clean energy services	Each VPA shall improve user's access to safe and affordable energy. Biogas fuel shall be available at the simple turn of a knob, requiring no laborious collection of fuel and no additional costs beyond initial setup other than for maintenance. As long as the manure digester is used and maintained properly, a secure supply of biogas will be provided in each project activity.
Human and institutional capacity	Each VPA shall offer vocational training to engaged staff on the marketing, installation and maintenance of the biodigesters. Women will be especially encouraged to take up roles in marketing, where

<sup>6</sup> FAO (1997) Regional Study on Wood Energy Today and Tomorrow in Asia: Regional Wood Energy Development Programme in Asia.

<sup>7</sup> IDBP Baseline Survey (2010, 2012).

<sup>8</sup> WHO (2006) Fuel for Life: Household Energy and Health: Section 2, p.19. Available at: <http://www.who.int/indoorair/publications/fflsection2.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> UN Women. Women, Poverty and Economics. Available at: [http://www.unifem.org/gender\\_issues/women\\_poverty\\_economics/](http://www.unifem.org/gender_issues/women_poverty_economics/)

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

	<p>their experiential expertise will be particularly beneficial to the success of the programme as a whole. Women, as the primary users of the technology, will be more effective at marketing the product to other women. Less time spent on firewood collection, user cleaning and cooking will also allow more time to be available for other activities, such as greater school attendance due to the reduced domestic responsibility of children.</p>
Quantitative employment and income generation	<p>The overall development objective of the programme is to promote and disseminate domestic biodigesters as a local, sustainable energy source through the development of a commercial sector that focuses its implementation through a multi-stakeholder sectoral development approach.</p> <p>The construction and maintenance of biodigesters in each VPA shall result in the creation of employment opportunities nationwide. By stimulating this new business sector, each VPA will therefore also create opportunities for entrepreneurs to enter the market.</p>
Balance of payments and investment	<p>Each VPA will contribute to the establishment of a long-term market for biogas in Indonesia, thereby helping to encourage further foreign investment in the clean energy sector. However, as it is difficult for IDBP to prove the exact positive impact the programme has on biodiversity, it is assumed to be neutral.</p>
Technology transfer and technological self-reliance	<p>Currently, the application of biogas for cooking purposes is a relatively unknown practice in Indonesia. Aside from a number of pilot programmes implemented in the 1990s and 2000s, biodigester use has hardly penetrated the country due to habitual, financial and technological barriers. Through the programme, each VPA shall stimulate nationwide adoption of biogas technology through (i) capacity development targeting users, construction service providers (CPOs) and equipment suppliers, (ii) the provision of an investment subsidy to the users on the purchase of the biogas technology, and (iii) the offer of credit facilities through a number of affiliated (micro) finance institutions. This programme will contribute to national development goals of reducing poverty in an environmentally sustainable way.</p> <p>Each VPA will hire and train local contractors and masons, thereby transferring technological capacity to local companies allowing them to further offer services in future. The biodigesters will be constructed using locally available materials. As part of the programme, each VPA will openly engage local communities in their activities, including offering training on installation and maintenance of biodigesters.</p>



## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

### SECTION E. DISCUSSION ON SUSTAINABILITY MONITORING PLAN (to be done per Methodology/technology/practice)

#### E. 1. Discussion on Sustainability Monitoring Plan

*Discuss stakeholders' ideas on monitoring sustainable development indicators. Do people have ideas on how this could be done in a cost effective way? Are there ways in which stakeholders can participate in monitoring?*

In terms of monitoring, the participants suggested that IDBP provides an online and offline communication tool to obtain inputs from stakeholders. This could also serve to disseminate information regarding the emission reduction activities implemented under the programme. Success stories should also be published. These success stories should be presented to the local and central governments so that biogas can be effectively promoted. On its website, IDBP is also suggested to publish results of meetings and other relevant updates.

In brief, these are the inputs from the attendants:

- 1) To provide a pool of information through inputs from participants, bulleting and e-mail.
- 2) Provide on-line as well as off-line forums for biogas discussion, and encourage it to the community since access to information is still low.
- 3) Spread the research results in order to gain stronger understanding and ownership
- 4) There are many success stories therefore these stories should be formulated and brought forward to the central and local government so that biogas can be encouraged and recommended in a structural manner.
- 5) Hivos owns a strong database of baseline data. The baseline should be published on the website and distributed to stakeholders for their knowledge.
- 6) Conduct a periodic evaluation in order to indicate the strength and weakness and accelerate the development.
- 7) Publish success stories generated under the IDBP.

#### E. 2. Continuous input mechanism

Method Chosen	Contact	Justification
<i>Continuous Input Process Book</i>	The book will be stationed at the provincial offices (PBPO)	While users are likely to have mobile phones, it is important to provide access to a physical log book. The provincial offices of the IDBP offer a convenient location for these log books, allowing users in the area easy access.
<i>Telephone Access</i>	+62 (0) 812 8030 2020 +62(0) 21 789 24 89	The provided number is a mobile phone number to enable users to either call or text their comments to IDBP. Mobile phone use is the primary means of communication nationwide,

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

		especially since landlines are expensive.
<i>Internet/email access</i>	<a href="http://www.biru.or.id">www.biru.or.id</a> email: info@biro.or.id	For users with access to the internet, direct contact with the IDBP through the programme's website is important.
Nominated Independent Mediator (optional)	Not applicable	

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### **SECTION F. DESCRIPTION OF THE DESIGN OF THE STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK ROUND**

[See Toolkit 2.11]

## Gold Standard Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### **ANNEX 1. ORIGINAL PARTICIPANTS LIST**

Page 1 of the participants list:

## Gold Standard PoA Local Stakeholder Consultation Report

---

### ANNEX 2. ORIGINAL EVALUATION FORMS

Evaluation forms 1 and 2:

## Main sponsors

firstclimate<sup>®</sup>

climatecare 

 **TFS** Green  
Part of Tradition

TRICORONA

one  carbon

## Supporting Sponsors

-essent 



 south pole

 **myclimate**  
Protect our planet

 **BNP PARIBAS**

## Developers Gold Standard version two

ECOFYS



Industrie Service

**FIELD**  
Foundation for International  
Environmental Law and Development